BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 04855 1212

ADVANCED CIVIL PROCEDURE

CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME II

John W. Morden

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
2000

SEP - 8 2003
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

ADVANCED CIVIL PROCEDURE

CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME II

John W. Morden

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
2000

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/advancedcivilpro02mord_1

ADVANCED CIVIL PROCEDURE

VOLUME II

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TRIALS

1. INTRODUCTION 1

[Overview of pre-trial and trial processes: class discussion. See, generally, *Courts of Justice Act*, R.S.O. 1990, c. C.43, s. 108 and the Rules of Civil Procedure (Ont.), Rules 24.1, 46-53 and 77.]

Burden of Proof
Sopinka, Houston and Sopinka, *The Trial of An Action*, 2nd ed. (1998) at pp. 49-51 2
The Law of Evidence
Friedenthal, Kane and Miller, *Civil Procedure*, 2nd ed. (1993) at pp. 466-472 4

2. THE MODE OF TRIAL – JUDGE OR JURY 11

(a) Historical 11
The origin of the jury system. Devlin, *Trial by Jury* (1956) at pp. 5-14 11
Civil Cases – Use of the Jury. Cornish, *The Jury* (1968) at pp. 74-76, 210 and 227-28 14
Abolition of Juries in Civil Cases: Report of Royal Commission – Inquiry into Civil Rights (1968) Vol. 2, at pp. 859-60 18

(b) Respective Functions of Judge and Jury 20
Friedenthal et al., *op cit.*, at pp. 477-482 20

(c) What Actions may be Tried by a Jury? 26
Courts of Justice Act, s. 108 26
Proceedings Against the Crown Act, s. 11 26
Public Transportation Highway Improvement Act, s. 33(9) 27
Toronto Star Ltd. v. Canadian Broadcasting Corporation (1975), 11 O.R. (2d) 289 (H.C.) 28

(d) In What Cases Should Trial by Jury be Selected? 31
Sopinka et al., *op.* at pp. 6-10 31
Cound, *Friedenthal* and Miller, *Civil Procedure – Cases and Materials*, 2nd ed. (1974) at pp. 781-783 36

(e) Picking a Jury 39
Sopinka et al., *op cit.*, at pp. 32-34 39

(f) Procedure for Selecting a Jury Trial and for Striking out Jury Notice before Trial 42
Rule 47 42
Constitution Insurance Co. of Canada v. Coombe (1992), 14 C.P.C. (3d) 322 (Ont. Gen. Div.) 43
Gracey v. Thomson Newspaper Corp. (1991), 4 O.R. (3d) 180 (Gen. Div.) 52
Dorland v. Apollo Leasing (1981), 33 O.R. (2d) 183 (Div. Ct.), rev'd (1981), 36 O.R. 2nd 16n C.A. 56
Iona v. Rooney (1987), 25 C.P.C. (2d) 174 (Ont.H.C.) 64
Nardo v. Fluet (1993), 13 O.R. (3d) 220 (Gen. Div.) 75
Soldwisch v. Toronto Western Hospital (1983), 43 O.R. (2d) 449 (Div. Ct.) 81
Strojny v. Chan (1988), 26 C.P.C. (2d) 38 (Ont.H.C.) 89
Martin v. Deutch, [1943] O.R. 683 (C.A.) 93

3. CONTROL OF THE JURY AT THE TRIAL LEVEL 102

(a) Dispensing with the Jury 102
Ryan v. Whitton, [1964] 1 O.R. 111 (C.A.) 102
Yachuk v. The Oliver Blais Company Limited et al., [1944] O.W.N. 412 (H.Ct.) 104
Cosford v. Cornwall (1992), 9 O.R. (3d) 37 (C.A.) 107
Hellenius v. Lees, [1971] 1 O.R. 273 (C.A.) 117
Hamstra (Guardian ad Litem of) v. British Columbia Rugby Union (1997), 145 D.L.R. (4th) 193 (S.C.C.) Headnote only 121

(b) Non Suit 123
McKenzie v. Bergin, [1937] O.W.N. 200 (C.A.) 123
McCaskill v. Ford Motor Company of Canada Limited (1955), 17 W.W.R. 239 (B.C.S.C.) 127
Ont. Motor Sales Ltd. v. Steeves, [1959] O.W.N. 205 (C.A.) 133
McCarroll v. Powell, [1955] 4 D.L.R. 631 (Ont.C.A.) 134
Hunt v. MacLeod Construction Co. Ltd. (1958), 15 D.L.R. (2d) 529 (S.C.C.) 139
Everett v. Dakota Ojibway Tribal Council (1990), 39 C.P.C. (2d) 529 (S.C.C.) 144
Bank of Montreal v. Horan (1986), 54 O.R. (2d) 757 (H.Ct.) 145
Payne v. Harrison, [1961] 2 Q.B. 403 (C.A.) 146

(c) The Jury's Verdict and the Judgment 156
Rules 52.08 and 52.09 156
Stirling v. Davis et al., [1950] O.W.N. 770 (C.A.) 157
Boutilier v. Traders General Insurance (1968), 1 D.L.R. (3d) 379 (N.S.S.C.) 159
Gobbo v. Rockingham Hardware Ltd. (1971), 24 D.L.R. (3d) 355 (N.S.S.C., A.D.) 167
Terkuc v. Herd, [1958] O.R. 37 (C.A.), rev'd [1960] S.C.R. 602 176
Cameron v. Excelsior Life Insurance Co. (1981), 19 C.P.C. 101 (S.C.C.) 193
Baboi v. Gregory (1986), 56 O.R. (2d) 175 (Dist.Ct.) 204
Sharpe v. Kim (1987), 67 Sask. 81 (Q.B.) 206
Loffredi v. Simonetti (1988), 29 C.P.C. (2d) 10 (Dist.Ct.) 209
R.E. Megarry, Q.C., *Miscellany-at-Law* (1955) at pp.157-58 214
Federal Rules of Civil Procedure (U.S.), Rule 50 216

4. THE COURSE OF THE TRIAL

(a) Rules 52, 53 and 1.08
217

(b) The Role of Counsel: Professional Responsibility 228
Sopinka et al., *op cit.*, at pp. 73-113; 124-129 228
The Rules of Professional Conduct, L.S.U.C., Rule 5 and Notes and Rule 10 and Notes 275

(c) Presenting Evidence at Trial – Devices to Facilitate or Supplant Testimony

(i) Formal Admissions 290
Rule 51 290
(ii) Judicial Notice 292
Sopinka et al., *op. cit.*, pp. 53-54 292
(iii) Presumptions 294
Sopinka et al., *op. cit.*, pp. 54-56 294
(iv) Inspection and Taking a View 296
Rule 52.05 296
Chambers v. Murphy, [1953] O.W.N. 399 (C.A.) 297
Myers v. Government of Manitoba (1960), 26 D.L.R. (2d) 550 (Man. C.A.) 299
(v) Court-Appointed Experts 314
Rule 52.03 314
Phillips v. Ford Motor Co. of Canada Ltd., [1971] 2 O.R. 637 (C.A.) 315
(vi) Medical Reports 325
Evidence Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. E.23, s. 50 325
Ferraro v. Lee (1974), 2 O.R. (2d) 417 (C.A.) 326
(vii) Examination for Discovery 330
Rule 31.11 330
(viii) Orders for Examinations Before Trial 331
Rule 36 331
(ix) Letters of Request 333
Sopinka et al., *op. cit.*, at pp. 68-70 333
(x) Affidavits 335
Rule 52.03 335
(xi) Evidence Given at Previous Proceedings 336
Sopinka et al., *op. cit.*, at p. 71 336

Split Trial 337
Elcano Acceptance Ltd. v. Richmond Richmond Stambler & Mills (1986), 55 O.R. (2d) 56 (C.A.) 337
Duffy v. Gillespie (1997), 36 O.R. (3d) 443 (Div. Ct.) 340
R.S.C. Ord. 33, rule 4 345

Failure to Testify 346
Mudrazio v. Holjevac, [1970] 1 O.R. 275 (H. Ct.) 346
Gibb v. Ellis (1959), 17 D.L.R. (2d) 262 (B.C.S.C.) 350

Reply Evidence 354
Allcock Laight 7 Westwood Ltd. v. Patten et al., [1967] 1 O.R. 18 (C.A.) 354

(d) The Conduct of the Trial Judge 358
In re Enoch, [1910] 1 K.B. 327 (C.A.) 358
Fowler v. Fowler, [1949] O.W.N. 244 (C.A.) 369
Regina v. Cook (1997), 146 D.L.R. (4th) 437 (S.C.C.) 370
Boran v. Wenger, [1942] 2 D.L.R. 528 (Ont. C.A.) 372
Briscoe v. Briscoe, [1968] P.501 (Div. Ct.) 373
Felker v. Felker, [1946] O.W.N. 368 (C.A.) 377
Majcenic v. Natale, [1968] 1 O.R. 189 (C.A.) 378
R. v. Pallett, [1970] 3 C.C.C. 430 (Ont. C.A.) 384
Bell v. Smith, [1968] S.C.R. 664 385
Sorger v. Bank of Nova Scotia (1998), 39 O.R. (3d) 1 (C.A.) 389

(e) The Case Goes to the Jury

(In the year 2000, pages 397-439 deleted.)

(f) When is the Trial Over? *Functus Officio* 440
Widrig v. Strazer, [1964] S.C.R. 376 440